



# REDUCING DUST AND SILICA EXPOSURES DURING CUTTING OF ROOFING TILES

John W. Sheehy, Ph.D. Alan Echt, M.P.H, C.I.H. Alberto Garcia, M.S.

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRO Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

## Respirable Silica Exposure Limits

- OSHA PEL enforceable standard
  - General Industry Standard formula

% Silica	PEL
100%	0.1 mg/m <sup>3</sup>
30%	0.3 mg/m <sup>3</sup>
10%	0.8 mg/m <sup>3</sup>

• NIOSH REL - 0.05 mg/m3

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRO Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

## Respirable Silica Exposure Limits

- OSHA PEL enforceable standard
  - Construction Standard formula

% Silica	PEL
100	2.4 mppcf
30	7.1 mppcf
10	16.7 mppcf

#### NIOSH REL – 0.05 mg/m3

CHILD HEALTH • GLOBAL PARTNERSHIPS • MINORITY OUTREACH • MONITORING HEALTH • COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

# Background

HHE Site Evaluations

- results from first and second site visit (2003)
- results from third site visit (2004)
- Western Site (2005)
- Skilsaw
- respirable and quartz results
- California demonstration (2005)
- Hytile cutter
- powered saws

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PRI Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA Health Education • Epidemiology • Workplace Health • Immunization • Workplace Safety • Training • C

## First Site Visit – April 2003 Roofing Tile HHE



- Crews consist of 3-5 workers
- Use of saws, leaf blowers, and other equipment
- Tile cutting on roof
- Mandatory use of hard hats, safety glasses, gloves

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRO Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA Health Education • Epidemiology • Workplace Health • Immunization • Workplace Safety • Training • C

## Second Site Visit – June 2003

- Four home sites selected for 2 consecutive days
- Respirable samples were collected for three crews

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRO Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA Health Education • Epidemiology • Workplace Health • Immunization • Workplace Safety • Training • C

## Respirable Silica Results (Sites 1 and 2)

- 16 employees sampled for respirable silica exposure
- 12 of 16 exceeded the OSHA PEL
- 14 of 16 exceeded NIOSH REL
- Dry cutting uncontrolled on cement tiles generates large amounts of dust
- Respirable silica levels were exceeded for all job classifications
- Respirator use had been voluntary

AL • CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRI Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA Health Education • Epidemiology • Workplace Health • Immunization • Workplace Safety • Training • C

## Third Site Visit – June 2004



# Hand held saw with control consisting of a custom made LEV connected to a shop vacuum

CHILD HEALTH • GLOBAL PARTNERSHIPS • MINORITY OUTREACH • MONITORING HEALTH • COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

### Dust Exposure Sampling Third Site

Respirable dust & respirable silica sampling:

- 6 samples were collected with the control "on" the saw
- 15 samples were collected with the control "off"

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PRI CHILD HEALTH + GLOBAL PARTNERSHIPS + MINORITY OUTREACH + MONITORING HEALTH + COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEA HEALTH EDUCATION + EPIDEMIOLOGY + WORKPLACE HEALTH + IMMUNIZATION + WORKPLACE SAFETY + TRAINING + C LTH + PREVENTION RESEARCH + PRIVATE SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS + PUBLIC HEALTH WORKFORCE + WOMEN'S HEALTH

### Respirable Silica Results Third Site

- With control: 3 of 6 exceeded the OSHA Construction PEL
- Without control: 7 of 15 exceeded the OSHA Construction PEL
- With control: 5 of 6 exceeded the NIOSH REL
- Without control: 15 of 15 exceeded the NIOSH REL

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PRI CHILD HEALTH + GLOBAL PARTNERSHIPS + MINORITY OUTREACH + MONITORING HEALTH + COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEA HEALTH EDUCATION + EPIDEMIOLOGY + WORKPLACE HEALTH + IMMUNIZATION + WORKPLACE SAFETY + TRAINING + C LTH + PREVENTION RESEARCH + PRIVATE SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS + PUBLIC HEALTH WORKFORCE + WOMEN'S HEALTH

## **Site Three Conclusions**

- The control on the saw was not effective at controlling employee exposures to respirable quartz
- Short-term respirable samples indicated respirable silica exposures were still above the OSHA PEL and NIOSH REL
- Engineering controls to reduce or eliminate dust exposure should continue to be pursued

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PROCEEDED • COMMUNITY PREVENTION • PROCEEDED • COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS • MINORITY OUTREACH • MONITORING HEALTH • COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

## **Control Study in West**



#### Skilsaw Mag 77 with Ventilation Control

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PRI Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

# **Control Study in West**



### Worker using leaf blower to remove dust

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRO Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA Health Education • Epidemiology • Workplace Health • Immunization • Workplace Safety • Training • C

### Respirable Dust Results Western site

Job	Number of Samples	Concentration (mg/m <sup>3</sup> )
Tile Cutter #1	3	1.07
Tile Cutter #2	3	1.14
Tile Layer #1	3	0.86
Tile Layer #2	3	0.22
PEL (General)		0.43

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRI Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA Health Education • Epidemiology • Workplace Health • Immunization • Workplace Safety • Training • C LTH • PREVENTION RESEARCH • PRIVATE SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS • PUBLIC HEALTH WORKFORCE • WOMEN'S HEALTH

### Respirable Dust Results Western site

Job	Number of Samples	Concentration (mppcf)
Tile Cutter #1	3	11
Tile Cutter #2	3	11
Tile Layer #1	3	8.6
Tile Layer #2	3	2.2
PEL (Construction)		9.5

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PRI CHILD HEALTH + GLOBAL PARTNERSHIPS + MINORITY OUTREACH + MONITORING HEALTH + COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEA HEALTH EDUCATION + EPIDEMIOLOGY + WORKPLACE HEALTH + IMMUNIZATION + WORKPLACE SAFETY + TRAINING + C

### Quartz Results Western site

Job	Number of Samples	Concentration (mg/m <sup>3</sup> )
Tile Cutter #1	3	0.38
Tile Cutter #2	3	0.37
Tile Layer #1	3	0.07
Tile Layer #2	3	0.08
REL		0.05

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRO CHILD HEALTH • GLOBAL PARTNERSHIPS • MINORITY OUTREACH • MONITORING HEALTH • COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

## California Site Demonstration

 NIOSH conducted an evaluation of the Hytile cutter and powered saws including a Partner wet saw. Short-term exposure samples were collected while testing a Bosch saw with vacuum control, a Partner gasoline saw with no water, and the Hytile cutter.

L + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PRI Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C TH • PREVENTION RESEARCH • PRIVATE SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS • PUBLIC HEALTH WORKFORCE • WOMEN'S HEALTH

### **Respirable Dust California Site** Tile Cutting Demonstration

SAW/CUTTER	Number of Samples	Concentration (mg/m3)
Hytile (8/18/05)	2	<0.7
Bosch(8/18/05)	2	<1.1
Hytile (8/19/05)	6	<0.6
Partner Gasoline	5	3.5
PEL (General)		0.53

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PRO CHILD HEALTH + GLOBAL PARTNERSHIPS + MINORITY OUTREACH + MONITORING HEALTH + COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEALTHIER + PEOPLE + SAFER + HEA HEALTH EDUCATION + EPIDEMIOLOGY + WORKPLACE HEALTH + IMMUNIZATION + WORKPLACE SAFETY + TRAINING + C

# California Site Conclusions

- An experienced tile roofer could cut roofing tiles quickly and cleanly with the Hytile cutter
- The Wet Saw was deemed to be unusable in actual construction
- Based on limited data the Hytile cutter produced less respirable dust than the powered saws

AL • CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRO Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

# **Future Work**

- Protocol and Peer Review
- Test Hytile cutter at a roofing site
- Identify additional engineering control methods for evaluation
- Conduct surveys at roofing sites to test control methods
- Conduct laboratory tests as needed

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PR Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA Health Education • Epidemiology • Workplace Health • Immunization • Workplace Safety • Training • C

## Potential Engineering Controls

- Commercially available LEV systems
- Commercially available or custom saws and cutters
- Cutting on ground with stationary masonry saws with local exhaust ventilation
- Other options
  - Substitute use of crystalline silica tiles
  - Maintaining a mandatory respirator program

AL • CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION • INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION • IMMUNIZATION • INJURY PREVENTION • PRI Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C

# **Acknowledgements**

- Rosa Key-Schwartz, PhD
- Ron Hall, MS, CIH
- Dan Farwick
- Manuel Rodriguez, CIH, CSP
- Randy Tubbs, PhD
- Chandran Achutan, PhD
- Rob McCleery, MS, CIH
- Judi Eisenberg, MD
- Ron Sollberger, CHMM

AL + CHRONIC DISEASE PREVENTION + INFECTIOUS DISEASE PROTECTION + IMMUNIZATION + INJURY PREVENTION + PR Child Health • Global Partnerships • Minority Outreach • Monitoring Health • Community Partnerships SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEALTHIER • PEOPLE • SAFER • HEA HEALTH EDUCATION • EPIDEMIOLOGY • WORKPLACE HEALTH • IMMUNIZATION • WORKPLACE SAFETY • TRAINING • C